

An open letter to Dr. Edmund Synakowski, the Associate Director of the DOE Office of Science for the Office of Fusion Energy Sciences (submitted on Sept. 14<sup>th</sup>, 2012)

This is a letter in response to the DOE Office of Fusion Energy Sciences (OFES) FY13 budget proposal; a letter from young research scientists and professors, those “under 40”, who have committed themselves to careers in plasma & fusion science.

The US Administration has made “a world-class commitment to science”, with the goal to attract more US students into science and engineering now, and to the international tokamak fusion project, ITER, scheduled to reach full operating capacity 15 years from now. These commitments should be applauded; and they should be acted upon in a sensible manner – maximizing the return on investment for the US taxpayer in today's tough fiscal environment.

With the price tag upwards of \$20 billion, ITER is the cornerstone of the world's fusion energy program. It represents a leap forward on the path to a viable fusion reactor. Yet, ITER is more than an engineering project. ITER will have to access, confine and control a self-sustained, burning plasma. The challenge of studying this plasma state is matched by the anticipation of what we will learn. There are theories of how a burning plasma will behave, and for how associated heat loads and energetic particles will impact the ITER wall materials. But one thing we know for sure: this is discovery science and a burning plasma will produce plenty of surprises when we get there. Some surprises may be advantageous, others we will have to mitigate.

The US plasma & fusion program must be in a position to understand and expand upon these new physics insights. The vibrant *domestic program* must be maintained and nurtured, so that today's graduate students and postdocs can become experienced scientists and leaders 15 years from now. Instead, the Administration's FY13 OFES budget redirects 1/6<sup>th</sup> of the FY12 domestic spending to the ITER project. If this trend continues, within the next two years hundreds of scientists and engineers at some of the premier US institutions will be laid off. In the long run, this will lead to *the permanent loss of some of the brightest young minds* from the US plasma & fusion program, and likely from the academic and research community altogether.

The fusion program has a public image problem: It was supposed to deliver cheap and safe nuclear energy long before many of us entered the field. But the US plasma & fusion program is much broader than energy research. We study supernovae explosions, solar coronal mass ejections, galaxy clusters, wake-field accelerators, the basic complexity of dynamical systems, and many other natural and man-made plasma phenomena. The enormous breadth of plasma science draws on many funding agencies, but the National Research Council 2010 Plasma Science Report has called on the DOE Office of Science to take the “stewardship role” in guiding this multi-faceted and exciting research field forward. The Office of Science must act on this deed of trust, enabling us to capitalize on the public curiosity and interest in the 99.9% of the visible Universe we call a plasma.

The US Congress has consistently said that “ITER funding is not to come from the already underfunded domestic research effort”, yet the contributions to ITER are threatening to consume *the entirety of the domestic OFES-funded program*. The proposed FY13 US contribution to ITER is \$150M, on a schedule to double or even triple in the next few years. This makes us deeply concerned for the ability of the Office of Science to allow and encourage the domestic plasma & fusion research to survive and thrive.

The “under 40” crowd, those expected to lead our field in the ITER era, respectfully request:

Do not let the world-leading US plasma & fusion science program weaken in comparison to our partners and competitors. Instead, let us capitalize on the taxpayers' domestic R&D and ITER investments. Let us build a stronger and broader program to advance knowledge in basic plasma & fusion science and to prepare the US scientific workforce for the burning plasma era.

Signed by:

Dr. Vyacheslav Lukin, Naval Research Laboratory  
Prof. Anne White, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

---

Dr. Scott Baalrud, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Dr. Aaron Bader, University of Wisconsin – Madison  
Dr. Jessica Baumgaertel, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Dr. Nicola Bertelli, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Igor Bepamyatnov, University of Texas at Austin  
Dr. Carrie Black, Oak Ridge Associated Universities  
Dr. Joshua Breslau, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Daniel Casey, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory  
Prof. Paul Cassak, West Virginia University  
Prof. Jason Cassibry, University of Alabama in Huntsville  
Dr. Christopher Crabtree, Naval Research Laboratory  
Dr. Gian Luca Delzanno, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Dr. Ahmed Diallo, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Ilya Dodin, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Arturo Dominguez, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Mikhail Dorf, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory  
Dr. Seth Dorfman, University of California, Los Angeles  
Prof. Fatima Ebrahimi, University of New Hampshire  
Dr. Rebekah Evans, Oak Ridge Associated Universities  
Dr. Raymond Fermo, Boston University  
Dr. William Fox, University of New Hampshire  
Prof. Kai Germaschewski, University of New Hampshire  
Dr. Brian Grierson, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Ammar Hakim, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Jeremy Hanson, Columbia University  
Dr. David Hatch, Max Planck Institute for Plasma Physics – Garching  
Dr. Christopher Holcomb, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory  
Dr. Christopher Holland, University of California, San Diego  
Dr. Nathan Howard, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Prof. Gregory Howes, University of Iowa  
Dr. Yi-Min Huang, University of New Hampshire  
Dr. Jerry Hughes, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Grigory Kagan, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Dr. Noam Katz, University of Wisconsin – Madison  
Dr. Jacob King, Tech-X Corporation

Dr. Deepak Kumar, Johns Hopkins University  
Dr. Matt Landreman, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. LiWei Lin, University of New Hampshire  
Dr. Yijun Lin, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Yi-Hsin Liu, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Prof. Alan Lynn, University of New Mexico  
Dr. Kenneth Marr, Naval Research Laboratory  
Dr. Eric Meier, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory  
Prof. Saskia Mordijck, College of William and Mary  
Dr. Nicholas Murphy, Smithsonian Astrophysical Observatory  
Dr. Mark Nornberg, University of Wisconsin – Madison  
Dr. Matthew Reinke, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Syun'ichi Shiraiwa, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Andrei Simakov, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Dr. Artem Smirnov, Tri Alpha Energy, Inc.  
Dr. David Smith, University of Wisconsin – Madison  
Dr. Sterling Smith, General Atomics  
Dr. Bhuvana Srinivasan, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Kelsey Tresemer, Mechanical Engineer, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Alexander Tronchin-James, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory  
Prof. Francesco Volpe, Columbia University  
Dr. Gregory Wallace, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Graham Wright, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Prof. Alexander Wurm, Western New England University  
Prof. Setthivoine You, University of Washington  
Dr. Howard Yuh, Nova Photonics, Inc.

In addition to the 63 early career “under 40” plasma & fusion scientists who signed this letter by the time the December 2012 issue of Physics Today went into print, the concerns and hopes expressed herein are shared by a broad spectrum of scientists regardless of their age and professional status. If you want your name to be added to the below list of those in support of this letter, please email Vyacheslav (Slava) Lukin at [vlukin1@mailaps.org](mailto:vlukin1@mailaps.org).

Additional signatories (138 as of Dec. 21<sup>st</sup>, 2012):

Tyler Abrams, graduate student, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Cihan Akcay, graduate student, University of Washington  
Prof. Bruno Bauer, University of Nevada  
Prof. Paul Bellan, California Institute of Technology  
Prof. Herbert Berk, University of Texas at Austin  
Prof. Abraham Bers (Emeritus), Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Prof. Amitava Bhattacharjee, Princeton University  
Dr. Theodore Biewer, Oak Ridge National Laboratory  
Dr. Paul Bonoli, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Prof. Dylan Brennan, University of Tulsa  
Dan Brunner, graduate student, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Prof. James Callen (Emeritus), University of Wisconsin  
Prof. Troy Carter, University of California, Los Angeles  
Dr. Luis Chacon, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Prof. Benjamin Chandran, University of New Hampshire  
Dr. Choong-Seock Chang, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Eugene Chen, University of Texas at Austin  
Prof. Francis Chen (Emeritus), University of California, Los Angeles  
Dr. James Chen, Naval Research Laboratory  
Mark Chilenski, graduate student, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Mark Cianciosa, Auburn University  
Dr. Daniel Clayton, John Hopkins University  
Dr. Bruce Cohen, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory  
Dr. Neal Crocker, University of California, Los Angeles  
Dr. Julian Cummings, California Institute of Technology  
Evan Davis, graduate student, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Luis Delgado-Aparicio, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Prof. Daniel Den Hartog, University of Wisconsin – Madison  
Dr. Wenjun Deng, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Andris Dimits, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory  
Prof. James Drake, University of Maryland  
Prof. Jan Egedal, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Evstati Evstatiev, FAR-TECH, Inc.  
Dr. Christel Fenzi, CEA-Cadarache, France  
Dr. John Finn, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Dr. Catherine Fiore, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Prof. Jeffrey Freidberg (Emeritus), Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Darren Garnier, Columbia University  
Dr. Alan Glasser, University of Washington  
Theodore Golfopoulos, graduate student, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Robert Granetz, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Martin Greenwald, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Luca Guazzotto, University of Rochester  
Dr. Zehua Guo, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Dr. Walter Guttenfelder, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Prof. David Hammer, Cornell University  
Prof. James Hanson, Auburn University  
Prof. Adil Hassam, University of Maryland  
Mark Haynes, Concordia Power  
Prof. Chris Hegna, University of Wisconsin – Madison  
Dr. Don Holly, University of Wisconsin – Madison  
Aaron Hossack, graduate student, University of Washington  
Dr. Chengkun Huang, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Dr. Joseph Huba, Naval Research Laboratory  
Dr. Amanda Hubbard, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Tom Intrator, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Dr. James Irby, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Dr. Stephen Jardin, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Prof. Amy Keesee, West Virginia University  
Dr. Jay Kesner, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Joshua King, Oak Ridge Institute for Science and Education  
Dr. Ralf König, Max-Planck Institute for Plasma Physics, Germany  
Prof. John Krommes, Princeton University  
Dr. Carolyn Kuranz, University of Michigan  
Dr. Benoît Labit, École Polytechnique Fédérale de Lausanne, Switzerland  
Dr. Brian LaBombard, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Samuel Lazerson, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Ari Le, University of California-San Diego  
Dr. Jeffrey Levesque, Columbia University  
Prof. Zhihong Lin, University of California, Irvine  
Dr. Mark Linton, Naval Research Laboratory  
Dr. Bruce Lipschultz, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Paola Mantica, CNR-EURATOM, Italy  
Dr. George Marklin, University of Washington  
Dr. Earl Marmor, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Adam McLean, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory  
Dr. Dale Meade, Fusion Innovation Research and Energy  
Prof. George Miley (Emeritus), University of Illinois  
Prof. Hendrik Monkhorst (Emeritus), University of Florida  
Dr. Sara Moradi, Chalmers University of Technology, Sweden  
Dr. Auna Moser, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Dr. Christopher Muscatello, University of California, Davis  
Clayton Myers, graduate student, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Volker Naulin, Technical University of Denmark, Denmark  
Dr. Ales Necas, Tri Alpha Energy, Inc.  
Dr. Arturo Ortiz-Tapia, Mexican Petroleum Institute, Mexico  
Dr. Alexei Pankin, Tech-X Corporation  
Jeffrey Parker, graduate student, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Prof. Ronald Parker (Emeritus), Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Francesca Poli, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Tariq Rafiq, Lehigh University  
Dr. Abhay Ram, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Roger Raman, University of Washington  
Dr. Yang Ren, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. John Rice, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Steve Richardson, Naval Research Laboratory  
Prof. Barrett Rogers, Dartmouth College  
Dr. Thomas Rognien, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory  
Dr. William Rowan, University of Texas at Austin  
Prof. John Santarius, University of Wisconsin – Madison  
Prof. John Sarff, University of Wisconsin – Madison  
Joshua Sauppe, graduate student, University of Wisconsin – Madison  
Dr. Lothar Schmitz, University of California, Los Angeles

Prof. Earl Scime, West Virginia University  
Prof. Michael Shay, University of Delaware  
Dr. John Sheffield, University of Tennessee – Knoxville  
Dr. Charles Skinner, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Donald Spong, Oak Ridge National Laboratory  
Dr. Gary Staebler, General Atomics  
Dr. George Stantchev, Naval Research Laboratory  
Prof. Hillary Stephens, Pierce College – Fort Steilacoom  
Dr. Adam Stevenson, SiO<sub>2</sub> Medical Products  
Douglas Stone, graduate student, University of Wisconsin - Madison  
Dr. Dan Stutman, Johns Hopkins University  
Prof. Thomas Sunn Pedersen, Max-Planck Institute for Plasma Physics, Germany  
Dr. Jason TenBarge, University of Iowa  
Dr. James Terry, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Timothy Tharp, University of California, Berkeley  
Dr. Christian Theiler, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Prof. Edward Thomas, Jr., Auburn University  
Dr. James Titus, Florida A&M University  
Prof. Dmitri Uzdensky, University of Colorado  
Dr. Brian Victor, University of Washington  
Dr. George Votroubek, MSNW, LLC  
Jeff Waksman, graduate student, University of Wisconsin – Madison  
John Walk, graduate student, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Weigang Wan, University of Colorado  
Dr. Weixing Wang, Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory  
Dr. Thomas Weber, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Dr. Stephen Wolfe, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Kevin Woller, graduate student, Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
Dr. Simon Woodruff, Woodruff Scientific, Inc.  
Dr. Jonathan Wrobel, Tethers Unlimited, Inc.  
Dr. Glen Wurden, Los Alamos National Laboratory  
Dr. Yong Xiao, University of California, Irvine  
Dr. William Young, University of Wisconsin – Madison  
Dr. Fulvio Zonca, EURATOM-ENEA, Italy  
Prof. Ellen Zweibel, University of Wisconsin – Madison

Map of Where the Above Signatories are Affiliated

